

MINUTES
STATE UNIVERSITY SYSTEM OF FLORIDA
BOARD OF GOVERNORS
INNOVATION AND ONLINE COMMITTEE
FLORIDA A&M UNIVERSITY
TALLAHASSEE, FL
March 29, 2017

1. Call to Order

Chair Ned Lautenbach convened the meeting at 1:30 p.m. on March 29, 2017, with the following members present: Governors Ed Morton, Dick Beard, Sydney Kitson, Wendy Link, Pam Stewart (by phone), Norman Tripp, and Gary Tyson. A quorum was established.

2. Approval of Committee Meeting Minutes

Governor Tripp moved that the committee approve the minutes of the meetings held on October 17, 2016, and November 2-3, 2016, as presented. Governor Tyson seconded the motion, and the members concurred.

3. 2016 Annual Report for Online Education

Dr. Nancy McKee gave an overview of the first Annual Report for Online Education. She said that the term "distance learning" is frequently used in the report rather than "online education." Dr. McKee clarified that distance learning includes the use of different types of technology when the instructor and student are separated by time or distance. It is a broader term than "online education" and has been statutorily defined. She presented the following points from the report:

- Florida is ranked second in the nation for the number of students who take online classes.
- Sixty-one percent of the State University System student body took at least one distance learning course in 2015-16. System-wide, 24% of undergraduate credit hours were in distance learning courses, although the percentages varied by institution.
- The annual report includes a time-to-degree table which reflects that students who supplement their courses by taking distance learning courses graduate faster than students who do not take any distance learning courses; Dr. McKee said the students who took 41%-60% of their courses via distance learning graduated in 3.92 years compared to 4.33 years for students who took no distance learning courses.

- Students who took only distance learning courses tend to be older than other students; the average age was 30 years old compared to 23 years old for other undergraduate students. Almost two-thirds of the students who took only distance learning courses were female.
- Of the undergraduate students who took only online courses, 96% were residents of Florida; of undergraduate students who took no distance learning courses, 93% were Florida residents.
- In the State University System, there are 210 distinct online majors and 329 total majors.
- Eighty-eight percent of students who took fully distance learning courses, and 88% of students who took only classroom courses, made grades of A, B, or C.

Governor Tripp moved the approval for the 2016 Annual Report for Online Education. Governor Kitson seconded the motion and members concurred.

4. Implementation of the 2025 Strategic Plan for Online Education

Chair Lautenbach remarked that over the past year, system-wide workgroups have been addressing many of the 49 tactics that were in the Strategic Plan for Online Education. Dr. Joe Glover, who serves as the Chair for the Steering Committee, stated that efforts of the workgroups are supervised by a committee of provosts and their work is reported to the Council of Academic Vice Presidents for review.

Dr. Pam Northrup presented on behalf of the Quality Workgroup, indicating there is an intent for a course review process and then a recognition process for the development of quality and high quality online courses voluntarily submitted by faculty for review. She said the Quality Workgroup recommends that there be a state level subscription to Quality Matters provided by the Florida Virtual Campus with institutions being able to participate as affiliate institutions. There is a cost of \$5,000 for the Florida Virtual Campus and around \$1,100 for affiliate institutions. There are additional fees that go with the external high level quality course review. The recommendation for today is that a process be created, that Quality Matters be adopted at a system level, with a crosswalk being created for those institutions that have their own quality standards, and that the process be put in place so that faculty can be recognized in the Florida Virtual Campus course catalog for the development of quality and high quality courses.

Dr. Northrup indicated that there are some institutions that have created their own standards of quality. Overall, all models that measure quality are very similar. It is not about the content of the course, but about the development and quality of the course. Governor Tripp asked why it would not be in the best interest of the system going forward to have one way of looking at it. Dr. Glover indicated that the goal in the end is to have a designation of high quality courses and quality courses that would be explicitly recognized in the FLVC catalog and course descriptions signifying that the

courses have met a set of standards. Governor Tyson said there are two groups of faculty that are interested in doing online; one that is interested in the content and the other that is interested in pushing for new ways to do online learning. He said his minor concern is if they stick to one form as a conformity method, faculty might lose the ability to try new methods of doing online education.

Governor Tripp moved to approve the recommendations from the Quality Workgroup on quality course review. Governor Morton seconded the motion and members concurred.

Dr. Northrup said that the quality course designation is the second piece of this recommendation. The tactic will identify courses with the opportunity to be awarded a President's Award, Florida Quality Award, and a Chancellor's Award in addition to the Quality Matters certification. The workgroup will continue to work through the designations and process for people to be able to apply for those awards. The idea is that any course that goes through the Quality Matters designation will be given some type of a seal and faculty will be able to apply for one of these significant state level awards.

Governor Tripp moved to approve the recommendations from the Quality Workgroup on quality course designation. Governor Morton seconded the motion and members concurred.

Dr. Andy McCollough, Chair of the Online Programs and Courses Workgroup, indicated that his workgroup had 9 tactics assigned to it. Dr. McCollough introduced Mike Ronco to discuss Access Tactic 1.1.2., which was to review the current offerings of fully online degree programs by Classification of Instructional Programs (CIP) codes and make recommendations to address the gaps. Mr. Ronco indicated there were five recommendations in the agenda packet, and he explained the process used to develop those recommendations. The first step was to compile an inventory of existing online program offerings, with online programs being defined as majors; identify gaps in those offerings by using the Board of Governors Areas of Strategic Emphasis CIP codes; and make recommendations to try to reduce those gaps.

Dr. McCollough discussed Affordability Tactic 1.2.2. The recommendation of the workgroup was that a university be designated to establish, maintain, and manage a repository with state general education core courses. He said the notion is that the institutions would have searchable access to full courses, modules, videos, and ancillary materials to establish, supplement, or enrich their online and resident courses. A faculty oversight committee with system-wide representation would establish standards and maintain oversight of the materials in terms of quality and accessibility. Dr. McCollough noted that the recommendation for these master courses is that they be

available on an opt-in basis. The goal is to provide access to high quality content that could be used to supplement or fill gaps in general education programs.

Dr. Northrup presented recommendations that addressed the tactic on shared degree programs. The workgroup recommended that a system-wide shared degree program task force be created to determine if the models are viable for our state, viable to meet some of the potential online programs that are currently not developed in Florida, and are not duplicative of activities that are already happening in the state.

Ms. Jennifer Smith presented Affordability Tactic 2.1.1., which is to determine and promote methods to increase the use of open access and educational resources to reduce the costs to students. She said this tactic has three recommendations: (1) to improve the adoption of existing OER and e-text material through the selection and implementation of an OER and e-text catalog tool; (2) to implement a state-wide public relations and marketing effort to increase faculty awareness and to coordinate usage, training, and technical support across the state, with new courses investigating the use of OER; and (3) to select and implement a repository tool to support the sharing and adoption of new open educational resources.

Governor Morton noted that the cost per semester is a great challenge for many students. He asked if there are any conflicts between revenue sharing and faculty that would serve as an impediment to moving this initiative forward. Vikki Shirley said that faculty members who are enjoying financial benefits would be prohibited by Florida statutes to require students to buy their textbooks. Governor Lautenbach said the Committee would look into the issue of revenue-sharing.

Ms. Smith presented recommendations for Affordability Tactic 2.1.2., to reduce the cost of e-textbooks for students. The workgroup recommended (1) adopting e-texts, which is a cheaper alternative than print text; (2) negotiating volume pricing through the state system or other consortiums, such as Unizin; (3) aggregating e-text and OER options into one catalog tool; (4) leveraging and expanding library resources to support the appropriate use cases; and (5) implementing marketing and public relations efforts to support the e-text adoption.

Dr. Tom Cavanagh said that his subcommittee was charged with developing a proposal for managing innovation across the state; more specifically, to oversee experimental pilot projects that would push the boundaries of current technology and practice in order to disrupt existing models and to positively impact the constraints of the iron triangle of quality, cost, and access. The workgroup recommended (1) establishing a coordinating body at the system level; (2) convening an annual Florida Higher Education Innovation Summit, where all the projects that received funding would come together to share their results; and (3) obtaining recurring funding in order to enable and implement this initiative.

Governor Tripp moved to approve the recommendations from the Online Programs and Courses Workgroup. Governor Kitson seconded the motion. Members concurred, with Governor Tyson voting in the negative against the recommendation that had a faculty oversight committee being appointed by the administration when he thought it should be appointed by the Faculty Senate.

Mr. Joseph Riquelme discussed the Infrastructure Workgroup's Quality Tactic 2.2.2., which is to develop a structure to facilitate collaboration system-wide in evaluating and recommending the purchasing of software to ensure cost efficiency and effectiveness. The workgroup recommends the formation of a state education licensing committee, which will facilitate collaborations system-wide. The committee will develop a three-year plan on the technology that will be explored and the procurement process for that technology. There will be opt-in master contracts for institutions.

Mr. Riquelme also discussed Affordability Tactic 1.1.2., which is to explore additional items for potential sharing to expand the quality of student online learning while reducing costs through efficiency. The workgroup focused on developing a comprehensive Proctoring Network at the system level.

Governor Tripp asked if they had thought about putting together a study group of students that they follow on an on-going basis to get feedback to see how well everything the Board is putting in place works for them. Dr. Glover responded for UF, saying the university convenes focus groups on a regular basis to discuss student experiences and how different processes work for them. He said the Steering Committee had not had a discussion for the system and would put the issue on its agenda.

Governor Link asked for some examples on how to make sure the student who is enrolled in the course is the one who is actually taking the exams online. Mr. Riquelme responded by explaining one model where students are expected to have a webcam available when taking the exam. Before they can take the exam, the student has to show the webcam a driver's license or student I.D. There are also additional security questions and the student has to show a 360-degree view of the room in which the exam is being taken. The proctor on the other side of the webcam is able to watch the student take the exam and see what the student is doing on his or her desktop. Some new technology has a way of knowing if a student searches a question or information on cellphones or other device during the exam.

Governor Kitson asked if it was possible to require at least one exam to be taken in person. Mr. Riquelme said that there are certain programs that require exams to be taken in person, but there are some programs that are completely online with exams that are monitored through virtual proctoring.

Governor Tripp moved to approve the recommendations from the Infrastructure Workgroup. Governor Tyson seconded the motion and members concurred.

Dr. Vicki Brown discussed the work of the Student Services Workgroup and noted that it has received national attention. Quality Tactic 2.3.1 and Access Tactic 1.1.6 are about the scorecard and recommendations on how to handle distance learning student support services. The purpose of the scorecard is to make an easy-to-use process to evaluate student services at postsecondary institutions for students who are mostly off campus. It was also designed to evaluate the weaknesses and strengths of student services provided. The workgroup ended up with 42 quality indicators that cross 11 different categories. An interactive website has been created and an institution can log on and enter its scores, which will result in recommendations from the guide book being displayed for areas that have weak scores.

The workgroup also addressed the tactic on technology access for online students. She said this tactic was broader than just the SUS, so the recommendation is that it be referred to the Higher Education Coordinating Council for consideration.

Governor Tripp moved to approve the recommendations from the Student Services Workgroup. Governor Morton seconded the motion and members concurred.

Dr. DeLuca discussed Quality Tactic 1.2.2, which is to encourage faculty participation and professional development before teaching online. She said that the website, TOPkit.org, has an online certification course, which the workgroup recommends be used as the standard for certifying faculty to teach online.

Governor Tripp moved to approve the recommendations from the Professional Development Workgroup. Governor Morton seconded the motion and members concurred.

5. Concluding Remarks and Adjournment

Governor Lautenbach adjourned the meeting at 2:44 p.m.